

Roman Catholic Church: Magisterium

© Copyright 2017 by Colin James III All rights reserved.

A logical assessment of tradition, scripture, and authority in "Dei Verbum", 1965

[The text of Chapter 2 in *Dei Verbum* follows at the end with assertions in bold.]

1. We evaluate the order of appearance of non scriptural citations in Articles 7-10 based on Church dates in bold:

- 7.: 2. Council of Trent, **1545**; 3. Irenaeus, **180**
- 8.: 4. Second Council of Nicea, **787**, Fourth Council of Constance, **1414**;
5. First Vatican Council, **1869**
- 9.: 6. Council of Trent, **1545**
- 10.: 7. Pius XII, **1950**; 8. First Vatican Council, **1869**; 9. Pius XII, **1950**

The argument of Articles 7-10 does not draw on citations to be sequentially increasing in time, viz:

180, 787, 1414, 1545, 1545, 1869, 1869, 1950, 1950.

2. We next evaluate the final assertion in Article 10 of:

[T]hat sacred tradition, Sacred Scripture and the teaching authority of the Church ... are so linked and joined together that one cannot stand without the others. (1)

We map this using the Meth8 modal logic model checker in script.

LET: p sacred tradition; q sacred scripture; r teaching authority;
necessity (for all instances, the universal quantifier \forall);
% possibility (for at least one instance, the existential quantifier \exists);
#q the necessity of Sacred Scripture;
%r the possibility of teaching authority of the Church;
& And; + Or; > Imply

We rewrite Eq. 1 as:

If the sacred tradition and the necessity of Sacred Scripture and the possibility of Church teaching authority, then not either the sacred tradition or the necessity of Sacred Scripture or the possibility of the Church teaching authority. (2)

Eq. 2 is also rewritten in an equivalent expression as:

The sacred tradition and the necessity of Sacred Scripture and the possibility of Church teaching authority all imply not separately that either the sacred tradition or the necessity of Sacred Scripture or the possibility of the Church teaching authority. (3)

$(p \ \& \ (\#q \ \& \ \%r)) \ > \ \sim(\#p \ + \ (\#q \ + \%r))$; *not* tautologous (4)

In the five models of Meth8, repeating fragments of the respective truth tables are:

where the designated truth values are T and E with the first letter definiens as True, Evaluated, Unevaluated, Proper, and Improper.

This means according to the VL4 logic system of Meth8 that Eq. 2 or 3 is not validated true, and hence Eq. 1 is found to be non sequitur and mistaken.

From: <http://www.cin.org/v2revel.html>:

CHAPTER II HANDING ON DIVINE REVELATION

7. In His gracious goodness, God has seen to it that what He had revealed for the salvation of all nations would abide perpetually in its full integrity and be handed on to all generations. Therefore Christ the Lord in whom the full revelation of the supreme God is brought to completion (see Cor. 1:20; 3:13; 4:6), commissioned the Apostles to preach to all men that Gospel which is the source of all saving truth and moral teaching,[1] and to impart to them heavenly gifts. This Gospel had been promised in former times through the prophets, and Christ Himself had fulfilled it and promulgated it with His lips. This commission was faithfully fulfilled by the Apostles who, by their oral preaching, by example, and by observances handed on what they had received from the lips of Christ, from living with Him, and from what He did, or what they had learned through the prompting of the Holy Spirit. The commission was fulfilled, too, by those Apostles and apostolic men who under the inspiration of the same Holy Spirit committed the message of salvation to writing.[2. *citing Council of Trent, 1545*]

But in order to keep the Gospel forever whole and alive within the Church, the Apostles left bishops as their successors, "handing over" to them "the authority to teach in their own place." [3] This sacred tradition, therefore, and Sacred Scripture of both the Old and New Testaments are like a mirror in which the pilgrim Church on earth looks at God, from whom she has received everything, until she is brought finally to see Him as He is, face to face (see 1 John 3:2).

8. And so the apostolic preaching, which is expressed in a special way in the inspired books, was to be preserved by an unending succession of preachers until the end of time. Therefore the Apostles, handing on what they themselves had received, warn the faithful to hold fast to the traditions which they have learned either by word of mouth or by letter (see 2 Thess. 2:15), and to fight in defense of the faith handed on once and for all (see Jude 1:3) [4. *citing Second Council of Nicea, 787, and Fourth Council of Constance, 1414*]

Now what was handed on by the Apostles includes everything which contributes toward the holiness of life and increases in faith of the people of God; and so the Church, in her teaching, life and worship, perpetuates and hands on to all generations all that she herself is, all that she believes. **This tradition which comes from the Apostles develops in the Church with the help of the Holy Spirit.** [5. *citing First Vatican Council, 1869*] For there is a growth in the understanding of the realities and the words which have been handed down. This happens through the contemplation and study made by believers, who treasure these things in their hearts (see Luke, 2:19, 51) through a penetrating understanding of the spiritual realities which they experience, and through the preaching of those who have received through episcopal succession the sure gift of truth. For as the centuries succeed one another, the Church constantly moves forward toward the fullness of divine truth until the words of God reach their complete fulfillment in her.

The words of the holy fathers witness to the presence of this living tradition, whose wealth is poured into the practice and life of the believing and praying Church. Through the same tradition the Church's full canon of the sacred books is known, and the sacred writings themselves are more profoundly understood and unceasingly made active in her; and thus God, who spoke of old, uninterruptedly converses with the bride of His beloved Son; and the Holy Spirit, through whom the living voice of the Gospel resounds in the Church, and through her, in the world, leads unto all truth those who believe and makes the word of Christ dwell abundantly in them (see Col. 3:16).

9. Hence there exists a close connection and communication between sacred tradition and Sacred Scripture. For both of them, flowing from the same divine wellspring, in a certain way merge into a unity and tend toward the same end. For Sacred Scripture is the word of God inasmuch as it is consigned to writing under the inspiration of the divine Spirit, while sacred tradition takes the word of God entrusted by Christ the Lord and the Holy Spirit to the Apostles, and hands it on to their successors in its full purity, so that led by the light of the Spirit of truth they may in proclaiming it preserve this word of God faithfully, explain it, and make it more widely known. **Consequently it is not from Sacred Scripture alone that the Church draws her certainty about everything which has been revealed. Therefore both sacred tradition and Sacred Scripture are to be accepted and venerated with the same sense of loyalty and reverence.** [6. citing *Council of Trent, 1545*]

10. **Sacred tradition and Sacred Scripture form one sacred deposit of the word of God, committed to the Church.** Holding fast to this deposit the entire holy people united with their shepherds remain always steadfast in the teaching of the Apostles, in the common life, in the breaking of the bread and in prayers (see Acts 2, 42, Greek text), so that holding to, practicing and professing the heritage of the faith, it becomes on the part of the bishops and faithful a single common effort.[7. citing *Pius XII, 1950*]

But the task of authentically interpreting the word of God, whether written or handed on,[8. citing *First Vatican Council, 1869*] has been entrusted exclusively to the living teaching office of the Church.[9. citing *Pius XII, 1950*] whose authority is exercised in the name of Jesus Christ. **This teaching office is not above the word of God, but serves it**, teaching only what has been handed on, listening to it devoutly, guarding it scrupulously and explaining it faithfully in accord with a divine commission and with the help of the Holy Spirit, it draws from this one deposit of faith everything which it presents for belief as divinely revealed.

It is clear, therefore, that **sacred tradition, Sacred Scripture and the teaching authority of the Church**, in accord with God's most wise design, **are so linked and joined together that one cannot stand without the others**, and that all together and each in its own way under the action of the one Holy Spirit contribute effectively to the salvation of souls.

CHAPTER II

1. cf. Matt. 28:19-20, and Mark 16:15; Council of Trent, session IV, Decree on Scriptural Canons: Denzinger 783 (1501).
2. cf. Council of Trent, loc. cit.; First Vatican Council, session III, Dogmatic Constitution on the Catholic Faith, Chap. 2, "On revelation:" Denzinger 1787 (3005).
3. St. Irenaeus, "Against Heretics" III, 3, 1: PG 7, 848; Harvey, 2, p. 9.
4. cf. Second Council of Nicea: Denzinger 303 (602); Fourth Council of Constance, session X, Canon I: Denzinger 336 (650-652).
5. cf. First Vatican Council, Dogmatic Constitution on the Catholic Faith, Chap. 4, "On Faith and Reason:" Denzinger 1800 (3020).
6. cf. Council of Trent, session IV, loc. cit.: Denzinger 783 (1501).
7. cf. Pius XII, apostolic constitution, "Munificentissimus Deus," Nov. 1, 1950: A.A.S. 42 (1950) P. 756, *Collected Writings of St. Cyprian*, Letter 66, 8: Hartel, III, B, p. 733: "The Church [is] people united with the priest and the pastor together with his flock."
8. cf. First Vatican Council, Dogmatic Constitution on the Catholic Faith, Chap. 3 "On Faith." Denzinger 1792 (3011).
9. cf. Pius XII, encyclical "Humani Generis," Aug. 12, 1950: A. A.S. 42 (1950) PP. 568-69: Denzinger 2314 (3886).