

Propositional Logic Without The Deduction Theorem

Henry Wong

Abstract

In propositional logic, given a set of axioms, we can derive formulas. Here we present the derivations of some formulas without the use of the Deduction Theorem. The derivations are presented compactly with only few referrals to other theorems. Most textbooks in this subject avoid this kind of approach.

1. Introduction

For well-formed formulas $\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{B}, \mathcal{C}$, a set of axioms is as follows:

$$(L1) \quad \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{B} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})$$

$$(L2) \quad (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{B} \rightarrow \mathcal{C})) \rightarrow ((\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}) \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{C}))$$

$$(L3) \quad (\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \mathcal{B}) \rightarrow (\mathcal{B} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}).$$

The rule of inference is *modus ponens* abbreviated by MP.

2. Results

$$(T1) \quad \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B})$$

Proof. [1] p. 32.

$$(T2) \quad \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}$$

Proof. [1] p. 32.

$$(T3) \quad \sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}$$

Proof.

- (1) $\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A})$ (T1)
- (2) $(\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})$ (L3)
- (3) $((\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow ((\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})))$ (L1)
- (4) $\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow ((\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}))$ (2), (3) MP
- (5) $(\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow ((\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}))) \rightarrow ((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A})) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})))$ (L2)
- (6) $(\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A})) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}))$ (4), (5) MP
- (7) $\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})$ (1), (6) MP
- (8) $(\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})) \rightarrow ((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}))$ (L2)
- (9) $\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \mathcal{A}$ (T2)
- (10) $(\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A})$ (7), (8) MP
- (11) $\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}$ (9), (10) MP

$$(T4) \quad \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \mathcal{A}$$

Proof.

- (1) $\sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \mathcal{A}$ (T3)
- (2) $(\sim \sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \mathcal{A})$ (L3)
- (3) $\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \sim \sim \mathcal{A}$ (1), (2) MP

$$(T5) \quad (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}) \rightarrow (\sim \mathcal{B} \rightarrow \sim \mathcal{A})$$

Proof.

- (1) $(\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}))$ (L1)
- (2) $(\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B})) \rightarrow ((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}))$ (L2)
- (3) $((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B})) \rightarrow ((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}))) \rightarrow ((\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}) \rightarrow ((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow (\mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B})) \rightarrow ((\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{A}) \rightarrow (\sim \sim \mathcal{A} \rightarrow \mathcal{B}))))$ (L1)

- (4) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow (A \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)))$ (2), (3) MP
(5) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow (A \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)))) \rightarrow$
 $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow (A \rightarrow B))) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)))$ (L2)
(6) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow (A \rightarrow B))) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)))$ (4), (5) MP
(7) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B))$ (1), (6) MP
(8) $\sim\sim A \rightarrow A$ (T3)
(9) $(\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow A))$ (L1)
(10) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow A)$ (8), (9) MP
(11) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow A) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B))) \rightarrow$
 $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow A)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B))$ (L2)
(12) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow A)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B))$ (7), (11) MP
(13) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)$ (10), (12) MP
(14) $B \rightarrow \sim\sim B$ (T4)
(15) $(B \rightarrow \sim\sim B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow \sim\sim B))$ (L1)
(16) $\sim\sim A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow \sim\sim B)$ (14), (15) MP
(17) $(\sim\sim A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow \sim\sim B)) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B))$ (L2)
(18) $(\sim\sim A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B)$ (16), (17) MP
(19) $((\sim\sim A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B)))$ (L1)
(20) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B))$ (18), (19) MP
(21) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B))) \rightarrow$
 $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B))$ (L2)
(22) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B))$ (20), (21) MP
(23) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B)$ (13), (22) MP
(24) $(\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A)$ (L3)
(25) $((\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A)))$ (L1)
(26) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A))$ (24), (25) MP
(27) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A))) \rightarrow$
 $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A))$ (L2)
(28) $((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim\sim A \rightarrow \sim\sim B)) \rightarrow ((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A))$ (26), (27) MP
(29) $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (\sim B \rightarrow \sim A)$ (23), (28) MP

(T6) $B \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C))$

Proof.

- (1) $B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B)$ (L1)
(2) $(B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C)$ (T2)
(3) $((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C)) \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C))$ (L2)
(4) $((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C)$ (2), (3) MP
(5) $((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C)))$ (L1)
(6) $B \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C))$ (4), (5) MP
(7) $(B \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B) \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C))) \rightarrow$
 $(B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C))$ (L2)
(8) $(B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C))$ (6), (7) MP
(9) $B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C)$ (1), (8) MP
(10) $((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C))$ (T5)
(11) $((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C)) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C))))$ (L1)
(12) $B \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C)))$ (10), (11) MP
(13) $(B \rightarrow (((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C)))) \rightarrow$
 $(B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C)) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C)))$ (L2)
(14) $(B \rightarrow ((B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow C)) \rightarrow (B \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C)))$ (12), (13) MP
(15) $B \rightarrow (\sim C \rightarrow \sim(B \rightarrow C))$ (9), (14) MP

(T7) $(A \rightarrow (A \rightarrow B)) \rightarrow (A \rightarrow B)$

